### UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

#### NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD

#### OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES

OCTOBER 2, 2005 \* Docket No.: DCA 06 MM 001

\* \*

\* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \*

Interview of: CAROL CHARLTON

National Transportation Safety Board 490 L'Enfant Plaza East, S.W. Washington, DC 20594

Thursday, October 20, 2005

The above-captioned matter convened, pursuant to notice, via telephone, at 11:08 a.m.

BEFORE: MARIETTE BURER

## APPEARANCES:

MARIETTE BURER National Transportation Safety Board

BOB FORD
Investigator in Charge
National Transportation Safety Board

MAJ. STEVE RIVENBURGH New York State Park Police

# I N D E X

ITEM_	PAGE
Interview of Carol Charlton:	
By Ms. Burer	4
By Mr. Ford	29
By Maj. Rivenburgh	42
By Ms. Burer	45

## 1 INTERVIEW

- 2 (11:08 a.m.)
- 3 MS. BURER: Okay, so we're recording right now. My
- 4 name is Mariette Burer with the National Transportation Safety
- 5 Board. Today is October the 20th, and it's approximately 8
- 6 minutes after 11:00 in the morning. I have with me --
- 7 MR. FORD: Bob Ford, Investigator in Charge, National
- 8 Transportation Safety Board.
- 9 MS. BURER: Go ahead.
- 10 MR. RIVENBURGH: Steve Rivenburgh, New York State
- 11 Park Police.
- MS. BURER: Ms. Charlton, go ahead and introduce
- 13 yourself.
- MS. CHARLTON: Carol Charlton, Tour Director with
- 15 Shoreline Tours.
- 16 INTERVIEW OF CAROL CHARLTON
- 17 BY MS. BURER:
- 18 O. Okay. I quess what I would like to do is for you to
- 19 go ahead and tell us in your own words what actually happened
- 20 on October the 2nd with the Ethan Allen. And you can start
- 21 from in the morning maybe and just guide us through the day's
- 22 events.
- 23 A. Okay. That morning, we left Indian Head Resort --
- 24 oh, all of my itinerary is not here with me. But we left at
- 25 approximately 8:00 in the morning to go to Lake George. Once

- 1 in Lake George, we were going to -- I didn't really know how
- 2 the day would progress in terms of would we have lunch on
- 3 route, or would we have lunch in Lake George? Everything was
- 4 dependent on how long the trip was, and how easy, you know,
- 5 rest stops would be for us. And I knew I had a full busload,
- 6 and I knew the rest stops would take us a good 30 minutes. So
- 7 to calculate all of that, I was kind of like while we were on
- 8 the road determining where we would be having lunch. It was a
- 9 pretty long bus ride. We were probably a good 4½ hours
- 10 anyways, and at approximately 1:15 in the afternoon we did
- 11 arrive in Lake George, New York, and we were scheduled for a
- 12 one-hour cruise from 3 until 4, and we were approximately 100
- 13 passengers for this tour because I had 2 busses of 50
- 14 passengers each, and the other bus was coming in from another
- 15 resort close by to the Indian Head Resort where we were coming
- 16 from. But we were all to regroup and start our combined
- 17 activities with the joint cruise. Prior to that, they would be
- 18 on their own for lunching and stopping for breaks and things
- 19 like that.
- 20 So while we were coming into Lake George, I called
- 21 the cruise company and, coincidentally, their name is Shoreline
- 22 Cruises, having nothing to do with us, but that was their name
- 23 as well. And I was -- my phone call to them was to ask
- 24 directions to their location. And when I called her the first
- 25 time, I indicated where we were coming from, and at that point

- 1 I was just looking at street signs to tell her where we were.
- 2 But somehow, we were disconnected and I never did get any
- 3 information. But all the while, we continued driving and I
- 4 noticed that we were entering kind of a busy downtown area. So
- 5 I suggested to the driver that he just pull over to the first
- 6 available parking area so that we could de-board because I'm
- 7 realizing that it's getting pretty late, and lunchtime needed
- 8 to be -- we had to eat. So once we did that, then I informed
- 9 the group that, you know, they would be having their lunch at
- 10 1:15 when we stopped, actually, until 2:15. And at that point,
- 11 I instructed them to return to the bus, and I'd give them
- 12 further information on the cruise because I didn't have any
- 13 information for them at that point because we were
- 14 disconnected. So they all scattered and went to different
- 15 restaurants along the way, a real pretty little town, Lake
- 16 George, and they all went different places for lunch. And when
- 17 they all left and the bus was empty, I once again called the
- 18 cruise company to get their location.
- 19 Coincidentally, we were parked very, very close
- 20 because we were parked right in front of the post office, and
- 21 the cruise ticket office was located at the back of the post
- 22 office and just across this little lane-way from it. So when I
- 23 asked the lady to please tell me where she was, she said to me
- 24 well where are you, and when I told her, she said just look
- 25 over your shoulder and you'll see us.

- 1 So what I did once she told me where she was located,
- 2 I then went down and walked over to the ticket office to
- 3 purchase our tickets. So I brought with me -- I always bring
- 4 this, it's part of the job, you bring your contract with you,
- 5 and I looked at the contract and we saw that the contract was
- 6 for 100 fares for this one-hour cruise. And, typically, a lot
- 7 of times we get comps. That means that there's usually a free
- 8 ticket for the escort, and maybe one for the bus driver if he
- 9 wants, but once I got down there, she had indicated that there
- 10 were four comps, and so I paid for 96 fares. And, you know, I
- 11 realized that she said to me when we arrived, well you're here
- 12 and, you know, I can easily put you on a 2:30 and you can go
- 13 from 2:30 to 3:30, and when the other bus comes, you know, they
- 14 can take the 3:00 to 4:00.
- 15 Well, what had happened on route is that I got a call
- 16 from the second bus driver that they were running late, and
- 17 they didn't know what time they were going to be in Lake
- 18 George. So I indicated this to the lady, and she said that's
- 19 all right. Whenever they come, they'll have their cruise.
- 20 Coincidentally, they weren't much more than half hour after us,
- 21 so they were able to take at exactly 3:00 their cruise. So she
- 22 said to me we are able to put you on a 2:30, you can take your
- 23 one-hour then. And I said to her, well, I will inform my group
- 24 of this option, you know. They've had a pretty long drive day.
- 25 We are expected at a resort later on this afternoon, and I

- 1 didn't -- I don't believe I said this but all the while I'm
- 2 thinking in my head, oh, wouldn't that be nice, because then we
- 3 end up getting to the resort earlier. This is a beautiful
- 4 Sunday afternoon at 80 degrees. There's a pool at that resort,
- 5 and then it brings us there that much earlier for our 6:00
- 6 dinner theater. So, you know, I thought the group was really
- 7 going to like this idea. So when they all came back from lunch
- 8 and came to the bus, I mentioned all that to them, and they
- 9 were very happy with that. Everyone was pleased. So they all
- 10 walked down to the dock. And -- oh, you know something I
- 11 forgot, Mariette? Can I back up a minute, please?
- 12 Q. Of course you can.
- 13 A. Okay. Once she gave me my receipt, I noticed that
- 14 there were no individual tickets being issued to me, which I
- 15 thought was kind of odd because I'm so used to having tickets
- 16 being given, and I questioned this. And it was then that I was
- 17 informed that tickets were not necessary. But, you know, I
- 18 further questioned this, and I said well how are you ever going
- 19 to know the difference between my group boarding your ship,
- 20 your boat, and other people wanting to take that cruise?
- 21 Q. Yeah, very good.
- 22 A. And she just said well, you know, our boat holds 50
- 23 passengers, and that's going to be your bus. And, you know, so
- 24 I just figured well, she's -- you know, she knows how she's
- 25 going to be placing all of us. So at that point, I just asked

- 1 her if she knew of a quiet place where I could have lunch, and
- 2 she said the pub next door. Well, when I got there, it was
- 3 very noisy and busy.
- 4 Q. Okay.
- 5 A. So I just went for a nice quiet walk, and I purchased
- 6 a nice vanilla latte and walked around the park thinking what a
- 7 pretty town I was in. Well, at 2:00, I returned to the bus,
- 8 and I gave the seniors the option, and of course everybody
- 9 loved the idea. They were so happy they only had to walk a few
- 10 yards down to the dock to get on for our cruise, and everybody
- 11 was just happy and chatty, and I had two couples that brought
- 12 me a small tiny box of pizza because they figured I wouldn't
- 13 have had time for lunch, and just beautiful people, kind, good
- 14 people. And so we all subsequently walked down that lane-way
- 15 and we boarded. And so because I stayed up by the bus to make
- 16 sure that everybody knew the news that since we were all
- 17 regrouped at 2:15, there was a tour that we could take 2:30 to
- 18 3:30, and as everybody was hearing that, they were all happy
- 19 and walking down to the dock thinking, you know, this is real
- 20 good because of the resort having such a nice evening planned
- 21 for us that night, and we were going to get there a tiny bit
- 22 earlier.
- So by the time I got there, most everyone was on the
- 24 bus, and I was walking with dear sweet Annie and her husband,
- 25 Max. And she's the lady that had the walker.

- 1 Q. Yes.
- 2 A. So as everyone's boarding, and I notice that two
- 3 gentlemen -- I can only say they looked like they had marine-
- 4 type clothing on.
- 5 Q. Okay.
- A. And one of them, he was all dressed in navy blue with
- 7 a jacket and the pants and the captain's hat, and the other
- 8 gentleman had a nice white short-sleeve shirt on with a
- 9 captain's hat on. And I, you know, from my third ear, I quess
- 10 everybody has one of those, but I could hear them discussing
- 11 numbers, and they were talking into the 40's all the time. And
- 12 that, I didn't, I picked up -- oh, I don't know, I just picked
- 13 up that they were discussing numbers and it didn't seem like it
- 14 was really -- I can't say that they seemed angry with each
- 15 other or anything like that, but just very perfunctory with
- 16 each other.
- 17 Q. Okay.
- 18 A. And so at some point anyways, I said now this cruise
- 19 holds 50, does it? And the gentleman in the white shirt said
- 20 yes, it does. So people are boarding and everyone, as I say,
- 21 is continuing to be chatty. And there were two girls, two
- 22 sisters that traveled with me, Annie and Jacqueline. And I
- 23 noticed that they were on the dock, and I said, girls, are you
- 24 joining us? And they said, Carol, look at the size of us,
- 25 honey, and look at the size of those benches. There's not

- 1 going to be any room for us. Besides that, we kind of think
- 2 that, you know what, we're just going to be way too heavy for
- 3 that boat and, giggle, giggle, because they saw that the seats
- 4 were pretty much all filled. And because both girls were
- 5 overweight --
- 6 Q. Right.
- 7 A. They decided to make a joke of their weight, and then
- 8 they said they were going to go up to do some more shopping.
- 9 Q. Right.
- 10 A. And I kind of felt bad for that because I thought,
- 11 heck, I know they're probably giving up this cruise, but they
- 12 were such extremely outstanding, two sisters, wonderful girls.
- 13 And I noticed different times they just seemed very kind and
- 14 good to these seniors, and I quite loved those two girls. One
- 15 was a Hospice nurse, and her sister worked in the hospital in
- 16 another capacity.
- So with all of that, I kind of bid them goodbye.
- 18 Never did I even think my dear sweet little Irish Rose, that's
- 19 what I called Nancy Drovich, she decided not to take the cruise
- 20 at the last minute. But, you know, I don't remember seeing
- 21 Nancy, which is why I was one number off every time the
- 22 rescuers asked me how many are on this boat, how many are on, I
- 23 always included Nancy in my count because I didn't realize that
- 24 she didn't go on, but she came down and decided she didn't want
- 25 to, and also went back up shopping.

- 1 So at that point, people just said there's a spot
- 2 available for you, Carol. There's a little spot at the front
- 3 bench at the front of the boat. So I was, I think, the last
- 4 one to get on. And once I got on and we boarded, then I
- 5 noticed that the one gentleman wearing the entire navy blue
- 6 pants and jacket, he got on and he started the cruise. That's
- 7 pretty much it, the whole thing. Now did you want to hear of
- 8 the cruise?
- 9 O. Yes.
- 10 A. Well we were, as I say, I cannot honestly tell you
- 11 did he speak to us on life jackets. I know at the very, very
- 12 beginning we didn't because I was listening, and he just
- 13 indicated that he was going to take us along the shoreline and
- 14 show us some beautiful mansions. And then, of course, we all
- 15 started gabbing amongst ourselves, and we continued to talk
- 16 amongst ourselves, and every so often break our conversations
- 17 with each other to listen to what he was telling us of the
- 18 beautiful homes. But then we'd get right into our own
- 19 conversation, and we happened to be just looking at a beautiful
- 20 shade of green carpet that Anna May wanted to show us all, and
- 21 she thought she wanted our opinion on her shade of green
- 22 carpeting. She passed it around to us and we all looked at it
- 23 and we started to giggle because it was the same color as
- 24 Carole Mahalak's sweatshirt. And I really quite don't know why
- 25 she showed us the green, I think it might've been for drapes or

- 1 something for her living room. But we all said what a pretty
- 2 shade of green that was. And as I see the little piece of
- 3 carpet back over to Margie sitting across from me, it wasn't
- 4 seconds later or a minute later, it was very soon after that,
- 5 that we made this violent turn to the left.
- And I only wish I could've heard what the captain
- 7 said, but I don't know what he said. And I can remember when
- 8 we made that very sharp turn, people started to laugh thinking
- 9 that he was doing a thrill for us, you know, something kind of
- 10 cute. And but within a half a second, within -- oh my
- 11 goodness, then we capsized and then we all fell into the water.
- 12 And I slid down to the floor and went into the water.
- And my own personal story of rescue is just, I guess,
- 14 mine with the Good Lord, I don't know what to tell you, but it
- 15 was pretty terrifying. But as you can see, I was saved. I
- 16 don't know what more I can tell you.
- 17 Q. Yeah. Are you doing okay now?
- 18 A. I'm doing good. I'm doing good because healing comes
- 19 in many different layers, and I kind of think that my layers
- 20 are okay because I've got good people around me.
- 21 Q. Okay.
- 22 A. And I have faith. I didn't know I had such faith,
- 23 but wow, I guess I do.
- Q. Okay. Do you -- did you sustain any injuries?
- 25 A. Well, I would've told you that when I was finally

- 1 brought up to land and the EMS and the paramedics and all of
- 2 our medical people assessed us and they put bright yellow tags
- 3 around our necks to tell what our medical status was, and mine
- 4 said in shock. Well, you know, I kind of argued that a bit
- 5 with them, and I said to them I'm not in shock, I can assure
- 6 you of that. I'm just simply very cold.
- 7 Q. Right.
- 8 A. But when I got into -- there was myself and two other
- 9 ladies, we were the last ones to go into the ambulance to go
- 10 into the hospital, and surprisingly enough, I was one of the
- 11 few admitted because the doctor did not feel comfortable with a
- 12 reading that I had, a cardiac reading, and they didn't know if
- 13 I had sustained heart damage.
- 14 Q. Okay.
- 15 A. They said that I had to be in the hospital 14 to 16
- 16 hours for observation. And I really, surely to God did not
- 17 want to go to the hospital. I wanted to be with the survivors.
- 18 And besides that, I felt fine.
- 19 Q. Right. Was that --
- 20 A. But, you know, he said I can't force you to stay in
- 21 the hospital, but I'm really uncomfortable if you leave. So
- 22 they did that, they kept me, and then the following morning I
- 23 was discharged but with the idea that I had to see a
- 24 cardiologist or at the very least a stress test.
- 25 Q. Right.

- 1 A. But when I was discharged from the hospital, I was
- 2 happy to go to the resort. And at that point, I realized
- 3 quickly enough that there was a bus leaving New York State to
- 4 go back home to Michigan at 3:00. The Canadian consultant,
- 5 there was a lady who drove up from Manhattan, and she came to
- 6 the hospital. She gave me a ride from the hospital to the
- 7 resort, and she suggested to my boss that in her opinion I
- 8 should be flown home -- the trauma. And it was her experience
- 9 that the sooner the better. That was her opinion. And when I
- 10 spoke to her and when I spoke to my boss, I said -- because I
- 11 knew that there was this bus leaving at 3:00 with 12 survivors
- 12 that were most anxious to go home. And I told my boss that I
- 13 would be up, and I was certainly okay to escort them home for
- 14 the two-day trip to come back.
- So that's what I did. At 3:00, 12 of them plus
- 16 myself, I'm number 13, my driver would be 14, 14 of us left to
- 17 come home. And in the weeks that I've been home, I've been
- 18 feeling fine. However, three days ago, I have a right knee
- 19 that's been really bothering me. So it's only a very, very
- 20 recent thing, and it didn't give me an ounce of problems. I
- 21 mean I had bruises up and down my leg and I had a scab on my
- 22 kneecap. It's still there, but I didn't have this funny kind
- 23 of pressure pain that I'm getting every time I put the least
- 24 amount of pressure on it. I'm not doing much with that because
- 25 I'm still very mobile and I can walk around, I'm fine. It's

- 1 only when I put any kind of pressure on it. So I don't know,
- 2 maybe I should go to the doctor's.
- 3 Q. Okay. When you -- so we're talking about Monday that
- 4 you actually left at 3:00 with the 12 survivors. Correct?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. Okay. And the resort, what resort was it?
- 7 A. That was called the Georgian.
- 8 Q. Okay.
- 9 A. They were very good to all of us. I went there and I
- 10 got there at quarter to 12 just in time for a conference to
- 11 take place, a press conference I guess it would be.
- 12 Q. Okay.
- 13 A. Because they had the governor, and they had the
- 14 mayor, and they had officials, and they had our investigative
- 15 people, Mr. Cleveland was there, some very, very good people
- 16 that came to the hospital the night before and took a statement
- 17 from me. Inspector -- I can't think of his name. A fine young
- 18 man.
- 19 Q. Okay.
- 20 A. And at that point, after we listened to what these
- 21 people had to say to us, then I went to my room and I took a
- 22 shower and I left all of my clothes because even though the
- 23 hospital staff had washed my clothes the night before at the
- 24 hospital, they still smelled very, very strongly of diesel and
- 25 gasoline, so I just left them in my room and had a change of

- 1 clothes and just had enough time to get on the bus and start
- 2 coming home with the group.
- 3 Q. Okay. Did you swallow any fuel at all?
- 4 A. Yes, I did.
- 5 Q. Okay.
- 6 A. As a matter of fact, when I went to the conference
- 7 and I was talking to some of these gentlemen, I had to excuse
- 8 myself time and time again because even when I opened my mouse,
- 9 I smelled of diesel fuel. And, actually, I did for three or
- 10 four days after, people could smell it out of my mouth.
- 11 Q. Right.
- 12 A. That's just because I drank some lake water. Now my
- 13 doctor who I visited for the second half of my physical once I
- 14 came home, she said she wanted to keep an eye on my lungs --
- 15 Q. Yes.
- 16 A. -- because she said her experience is this, that a
- 17 lot of times lung tissue can be damaged and it doesn't show up
- 18 for a little while.
- 19 Q. Okay.
- 20 A. So she wants to -- I don't like the idea of getting
- 21 x-rays so often, but I think she's going to want to x-ray my
- 22 lungs every three weeks.
- Q. Okay, okay. Now can you tell me a little bit more
- 24 about the violent turn to the left?
- 25 A. It came so suddenly, Mariette. It came out of

- 1 nowhere. It was a beautiful, calm, spectacular Sunday
- 2 afternoon. And we were marveling at how calm and glassy the
- 3 water was, how the day was outstandingly beautiful. And it
- 4 just came out of absolutely nowhere. There was not a stitch of
- 5 a hint that we were in any kind of a problem --
- 6 O. Yes.
- 7 A. -- before it happened. And it took everyone by
- 8 complete utter shocking surprise. And at first, people
- 9 couldn't help but laugh because it was such a crazy zig-zag
- 10 that we took.
- 11 Q. Right.
- 12 A. And then it was immediately after that that we --
- 13 that we capsized. And from my viewpoint where I was sitting,
- 14 we were all just sitting there talking.
- 15 Q. And then the boat turned to the left?
- 16 A. Yes, sudden --
- 17 Q. And it was kind of sharp --
- 18 A. Sudden. I have to call the word, it was violent. It
- 19 was a violent turn to the left.
- 20 Q. Okay. And then what happened? Which way? Did it --
- 21 can you describe what happened thereafter as far as the actual
- 22 vessel and how much longer it took before it actually capsized
- 23 and what side it capsized?
- 24 A. I can tell you -- I -- oh, this makes me feel so
- 25 shaky, I've kind of got myself shaky here again. But it's just

- 1 reliving it. I'm sure it will be this way for a little while.
- 2 So if my voice quivers, it's because I'm kind of shaky.
- 3 Q. Understandably so.
- 4 A. We were sitting there and -- you know, we were having
- 5 a beautiful conversation, Annie and I, Carole, Margie, Anna
- 6 May, little piece of green carpet, and we were sitting there,
- 7 and Anna May was telling me something. I can't even remember
- 8 what it was. And I just looked over, and I saw Margie Kidon
- 9 who was sitting across from me --
- 10 Q. Okay.
- 11 A. And I looked over to her, and she was one of the
- 12 people to have giggled because it was at that very moment that
- 13 we had the sharp turn to the left. And I saw her giggle, and
- 14 the next flash was I saw terror on her face.
- 15 Q. Right.
- 16 A. And I saw her fall backwards into the water. And at
- 17 that point, I remember sliding onto the floor, like sliding,
- 18 and I kind of just torpedoed into the water. And I was under
- 19 the water, and it was very, very dark green, blackish, and I
- 20 can remember flailing in the water. And the very first thought
- 21 that came into my head is I am going to die on this lake this
- 22 afternoon, and I had a very, very strong sad feeling of leaving
- 23 my family, but my hands and my legs were flailing, and I'm a
- 24 non-swimmer. I can't swim at all. And if you had me over to
- 25 your home for a barbecue, I'm the one that holds onto the side

- 1 of the pool and hardly ever goes to the middle of it.
- 2 Q. Okay.
- 3 A. You know, I'm just not a water person.
- 4 Q. Right.
- 5 A. Kind of afraid of the water. But anyways, I'm
- 6 flailing. And then I just suddenly had the most monumental,
- 7 immeasurable feeling of absolute love that I'll ever experience
- 8 in my life. It was so beautiful, and I was feeling so great.
- 9 Wow. Then my right hand touched something solid. It kind of
- 10 just touched it and I held onto it with everything I had. And
- 11 with some kind of power, I brought my body up to whatever that
- 12 solid piece was, and I can remember feeling a sadness because I
- 13 knew that that love was going away. I was feeling very, very
- 14 lost without that great feeling. But something that I then
- 15 noticed is that the black-green water became lighter.
- 16 Q. Okay.
- 17 A. And that's when I was able to resurface. And I
- 18 realized that I was holding onto the side of the capsized boat.
- 19 Now when I broke through the water and I, you know, came up,
- 20 the side of that boat, there must've been 15 or 20 other people
- 21 already on it. I think I was the last one on it because I was
- 22 at the very end of the line.
- 23 Q. Okay.
- A. And there was just a lot of absolute pandemonium.
- 25 You know, there were people, they all looked so shocked and so

- 1 sad and because I was at the end of that line, I was looking
- 2 onto their faces as they were looking onto mine. And I can
- 3 remember somebody was holding onto me from the back of me, and
- 4 I was holding onto the boat with everything I had, and did I
- 5 yell. I yelled across that lake with everything I had to help
- 6 us, to please come and help us, and I never stopped yelling. I
- 7 just kept yelling, and I remember some rescue boats coming and
- 8 being thrown ropes and rings and life jackets and the dear,
- 9 dear old people were just, some of them were saying I can't
- 10 breathe, I'm so tired. And we all held on very tightly at the
- 11 side of the boat. And I can remember, you know -- I'm sorry,
- 12 Mariette.
- 13 Q. Oh, Carol, don't worry about it. Really, please.
- 14 Can you take a minute -- that's fine.
- 15 A. Thanks. And we held on, and then somebody yelled out
- 16 -- they said anyone else need a life jacket, because a lot were
- 17 being thrown around, not a lot -- I guess I did see rings and
- 18 ropes and life jackets and people were going into the water,
- 19 and I just remember the people clinging to the boat along with
- 20 me. And I couldn't recognize anyone because without their
- 21 glasses and their hair wet, the dear little ladies all looked
- 22 the same to me.
- Q. Right.
- A. But we're holding on and holding on, and it seemed to
- 25 me a long time we were holding on, and then people started

- 1 yelling get away from the boat, get away from the boat now,
- 2 because the boat was sinking, and they saw that there was a
- 3 vacuum occurring. So just seconds before that, a lady with hot
- 4 pink shorts on and a pair of beautiful legs. I can remember
- 5 seeing just legs from somewhere. She said does anyone else
- 6 need a life jacket, and somebody looked at me and said she
- 7 does. And this lady whipped this bright orange life jacket,
- 8 and it was tiny, I think it was a child's one, she whipped it,
- 9 what seemed to me, across the lake and it landed in front of
- 10 me. I was quite horrified to lose my grip on the boat to put
- 11 it on, but with a real quick, quick motion with my other hand
- 12 that was cradling the side of the boat, I put it over my neck,
- 13 not around my body because it didn't have anything, any cords
- 14 to snap. It just -- but it was a life jacket, and I put it
- 15 around my neck.
- So when the rescue people in their boats told us to
- 17 get away from the boat, we all had to then disconnect from the
- 18 boat. And my little life jacket, I remember bobbing a couple
- 19 of times in the water, and it turned me around to the point
- 20 where there was a Skidoo, no one was on it, and it wasn't on,
- 21 it was just there rocking in the water. And I was able to
- 22 cling to the side of that Skidoo for what seemed a long, long,
- 23 long time to me because the wave action was all around, and I
- 24 was gagging on diesel fuel taste.
- 25 Q. Right.

- 1 A. And I could feel something around my legs under the
- 2 water, grazing my legs. But I was holding onto this Skidoo
- 3 very tightly, but I wasn't seeing anything, but I remembered
- 4 bobbing around for a long, long time in it. But then because
- 5 of so much wave activity, I realized that this little Skidoo
- 6 was going -- I was going to be crushed between that and a boat
- 7 because I was getting closer and closer to a boat, and that's
- 8 when I yelled to ask somebody to please help me. And that's
- 9 when Brian Heart, who was already in the water, came around the
- 10 boat and said to me put your arm around my neck, put your arm
- 11 around my neck, and I didn't want to at first because he was
- 12 just one small person, and my Skidoo was bigger than him, and
- 13 at least I could cling to the Skidoo, but he just said to me,
- 14 honey, put your arm around my neck, I will save you. So I did
- 15 that, and he brought me to Larry and Joyce Steinhart, their
- 16 boat --
- 17 Q. Right.
- 18 A. -- and there were nine of us women that they brought
- 19 to the grass.
- 20 Q. Okay.
- 21 A. I was the last one on the boat. There were lots of
- 22 other ladies on the boat. And when I got on their boat, I
- 23 looked across the lake and I saw that other boats had people on
- 24 them, other survivors were on the other boats. And there were
- 25 still some bodies floating in the water, but -- and I saw

- 1 bubbles and I figured that that must've been the divers, but
- 2 the rest of the time, I just had Joyce Steinhart, all she kept
- 3 doing was rubbing my back and holding me, and holding me, and
- 4 giving me clothes to put on, and just holding me always, and
- 5 she kept rubbing my back. And I'm not exactly sure, but I do
- 6 believe that I was the last, I was the last living person taken
- 7 out of the lake.
- Q. Okay. When you had said earlier that holding onto
- 9 the side of the capsized boat and there were already 15 to 20
- 10 people hanging on --
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. What side are you talking about? And are you talking
- 13 about at the stern, or bow, or left or right?
- 14 A. I don't know the proper terminology for boat, but
- 15 I'll tell you, I was holding on with my -- I was holding on
- 16 with my right hand, and my left hand was cradling the belly of
- 17 the boat.
- 18 Q. Okay.
- 19 A. And that's the position that I stayed in. And I was
- 20 just aware that somebody was holding onto my belt. I think the
- 21 lady was holding onto my belt as well as the side of the boat,
- 22 because I don't think that I would've had enough strength to
- 23 keep her and I both, so I think maybe one hand was on the boat,
- 24 and the other one was on my belt.
- Q. Right. Now who was yelling for you all to get away

- 1 from the boat? Was that official rescuers, or were those from
- 2 the recreational boaters, pleasure boaters?
- 3 A. No, those were recreational boaters.
- 4 Q. Okay.
- 5 A. I can remember Carole Mahalak, one of the survivors,
- 6 her and her husband, Joe, I don't know where Joe was, I think
- 7 he might've been in the water rescuing people, but Carol stayed
- 8 at the side of the boat. And I remember he yelling, get away
- 9 from the boat. But I think somebody from one of the boats
- 10 started it.
- 11 Q. Okay. Can you estimate how long you were holding on
- 12 before people started yelling to get away from the boat?
- 13 A. That I couldn't even tell you, other than it seemed
- 14 like such a long time because I was screaming at the top of my
- 15 lungs across the lake to save us, please save us. And I know I
- 16 said that over and over again. And I also managed to shut up
- 17 some times because I wanted to hear what some of the ladies
- 18 were trying to say to me, and how I was trying to comfort some
- 19 of them. And then, you know, when it seemed like people were
- 20 kind of quiet, and I then continued my yelling.
- 21 Q. Right. Now when you were holding on with your right
- 22 hand the belly of the boat, right?
- 23 A. Yes.
- Q. Where was the propeller? Or -- well, I guess you
- 25 couldn't see it then, could you?

- 1 A. No.
- 2 Q. No.
- 3 A. All I could see were the heads of people on the boat
- 4 along with me.
- 5 Q. Okay.
- A. I couldn't see a propeller. Now I do remember when I
- 7 went into the water, and why I should remember this, I was
- 8 sitting at the front of the boat. I shouldn't -- but didn't I
- 9 see smoke?
- 10 O. You did?
- 11 A. I think -- Mariette, I either saw that smoke when I
- 12 first went into the water, or as the boat was sinking.
- 13 Q. Okay.
- 14 A. But I remember seeing smoke.
- 15 Q. Did you hear any strange noises at all?
- 16 A. I -- say I did.
- 17 Q. How about during any time of the trip, like maybe --
- 18 any kind of engine noises, or foreign noises?
- 19 A. No, I'm sorry.
- 20 Q. Okay.
- 21 A. We were all having such a conversation, you know,
- 22 maybe I could have given you more help here, but we were a
- 23 gabby, gabby group sitting there at the front of the boat, and
- 24 we just talked a lot.
- Q. Right. Well, you guys -- you had been together for

- 1 quite some time before this whole tour, right?
- 2 A. Yes --
- 3 Q. So I'm sure that --
- 4 A. -- day six of an eight-day tour.
- 5 Q. Yeah, there you go. Did you recall anything about
- 6 the windows of the boat, if they were open or closed or --
- 7 A. Now it seems to me the windows were all windowless.
- Q. Okay.
- 9 A. Except for the front. And it seems to me I remember
- 10 seeing, I remember seeing -- did I see two Plexiglas panels on
- 11 each side of the front?
- 12 Q. Yeah.
- 13 A. I believe I saw that. But the others were all open.
- 14 There were no windows.
- 15 Q. Okay. Can you describe to me the actual seat or the
- 16 seating in the boat?
- 17 A. I can tell you that there was seating, it was bolted
- 18 to the floor, and as we were told by the two gentlemen in the
- 19 marine clothing --
- 20 O. Yes.
- 21 A. -- that benches could seat three people on one side,
- 22 and the benches could seat two people on the other side. So we
- 23 all were sitting at the front. You see, I wasn't looking out
- 24 at the lake. I would've been looking at the people across from
- 25 me because they had two little benches that were facing each

- 1 other --
- 2 Q. Yes.
- 3 A. And they were two-seat benches, and I was sitting --
- 4 I would be sitting to the left of Annie, and I was looking
- 5 across at Margie and Barbara. And sitting to my left on the
- 6 very first seat facing the front of the boat would've been
- 7 Carol Mahalak. And I can't remember who was sitting beside
- 8 Carol. And then Anna May Hawley was sitting across from me as
- 9 well.
- 10 Q. Was she sitting there next to Margie, Anna May
- 11 Hawley?
- 12 A. I wonder if she was sitting next to Margie or it was
- 13 Barbara. It might have been Anna May, because she's the one
- 14 that took -- I'm sure it was Anna May's little piece of carpet
- 15 we were all looking at.
- 16 Q. Right. Okay.
- 17 A. But, distinctly, I remember right across from me was
- 18 Margie Kidon. And she's one of the ladies from Trenton.
- 19 Q. Yes, yes. We've met. She's a lovely lady.
- 20 A. Yes. I think she's having a hard time.
- Q. Okay. I'm sorry.
- 22 A. But I will try so hard to think of anything I can for
- 23 you, but I'm sorry I -- if you have any other questions, I'd be
- 24 happy to answer whatever.
- MS. BURER: Okay. Yeah, I think we all have more

- 1 questions here. Why don't I go ahead and just pass it over to
- 2 -- the -- Mr. Ford.
- 3 MS. CHARLTON: Okay.
- 4 BY MR. FORD:
- 5 Q. Good morning, Ms. Charlton. I'm a little bit away
- 6 from the speakerphone. Is that okay? Can you hear me all
- 7 right?
- 8 A. Yes, I can hear you.
- 9 Q. I definitely appreciate hearing what you have to say,
- 10 the information you're given, and what you're telling us will
- 11 help us find out how this happened, and make recommendations to
- 12 prevent it from happening again.
- 13 A. Oh, wonderful. Oh, my, my.
- 14 Q. That's our entire goal.
- 15 A. Very good.
- Q. So I'm going to ask you some questions. I definitely
- 17 do not want to upset you, and that's what I hope you keep in
- 18 mind that that's what we're trying to do here.
- 19 A. Okay.
- 20 Q. So the first, the first thing is you were talking
- 21 about someone at Shoreline Cruises. I think you referred to as
- 22 a she. Do you have that person's name?
- 23 A. I don't. She's the blonde lady that was at the
- 24 ticket office. I wonder, did I ever write down names? I don't
- 25 believe I did, sir.

- 1 Q. Okay. That's fine. You described the two men in the
- 2 marine outfits.
- 3 A. Yes. Well, they looked like, you know the Navy --
- 4 O. Uh-huh.
- 5 A. That kind of outfit.
- 6 Q. Okay. Where did they, where did they go? I mean did
- 7 one of them just walk away? The last you saw, what was the
- 8 last you saw them, as they were talking?
- 9 A. Yes. They talked as if, quite frankly, they kind of
- 10 talked like they didn't like each other. It's just -- you
- 11 know, maybe it was just routine and they were being very per-
- 12 functionary with each other, but they were talking and just
- 13 kind of throwing across numbers. And it didn't seem to me that
- 14 there was a lot of cordialness between them. And then the
- 15 gentleman in the white shirt, he left. He walked away and the
- 16 other gentleman, the captain of the boat just got on and
- 17 started the cruise.
- 18 Q. Okay. So one of them was the captain.
- 19 A. I use the word captain, and I'm not even sure I'm
- 20 using that word appropriately, but the captain of the ship was
- 21 the gentleman with the navy pants, the navy jacket and the navy
- 22 hat.
- Q. That's the appropriate term, what we call him, that's
- 24 just a recognition as captain. That's perfect.
- 25 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. Okay. Now when you boarded the boat, were you one of
- 2 the first to board or the last?
- 3 A. I was probably the last one to board.
- 4 Q. So you get on -- go ahead.
- 5 A. Only because there was a little itty, bitty spot left
- 6 at the front bench.
- 7 Q. Uh-huh.
- A. And so many of them, they always tease me because I
- 9 am tiny. And they said, Carol, you've got such a skinny butt,
- 10 you could get over -- there's a little spot there for you right
- 11 at the front. And because, really, having the gentleman talk
- 12 on numbers, and as people were boarding, we weren't certain
- 13 that we were all going to take that cruise, or if there was
- 14 going to be another one. And that's when I remember asking the
- 15 gentleman well, how many will this boat hold. And the
- 16 gentleman in the white said 50. So, you know, you don't kind
- 17 of second-guess. You think well, if every -- the reason we
- 18 were thinking to take another tour is because those little
- 19 itty-bitty seats were getting filled up real, real fast.
- 20 O. Uh-huh.
- 21 A. People were kind of jockeying around to get a spot
- 22 just to sit in, which is why I think my two ladies, Annie and
- 23 Jacqueline, decided not to go on the cruise. And I offered
- 24 them to go on a different cruise, the one coming in at 3:00,
- 25 but they said no, they would much prefer just shopping and

- 1 meeting us after.
- Q. Okay. So you -- I don't want to put words in your
- 3 mouth, but it sounds like you were standing on the dock
- 4 watching people board and seat themselves. Correct?
- 5 A. I wasn't exactly watching them because by the time I
- 6 got down there, I was walking down with Mack and Annie --
- 7 because most of my time I spent up at the bus so that I could
- 8 inform everybody as they came from lunch that we were at the
- 9 location we needed to be, we did not even have to get back on
- 10 the bus to go to find this cruise company. We were there
- 11 already. And so when I told people that, then they walked down
- 12 on their own.
- 13 Q. Okay.
- 14 A. So with myself staying by the bus to make sure
- 15 everybody was informed of our cruise, I would've been one of
- 16 the very last ones to walk down to the dock. And when I did
- 17 that, I walked with Annie and Mack because she has the
- 18 stroller, and they were pretty much one of the last ones to go
- 19 down there. So by the time, say, the three of us got down to
- 20 the dock, I was aware that most everybody was in the boat, and
- 21 they were kind of various stages of walking to their seat or
- 22 being seated already, and some still on the dock. But pretty
- 23 much everybody was on the boat by that time. And when I was on
- 24 the dock, I had this great little conversation with the girls,
- 25 kind of overheard the two gentlemen talking numbers, and I said

- 1 I wonder if there's going to be any room here for me. And
- 2 that's when different people said there's a little spot up
- 3 there at the front. Now there is room for you, Carol, come on.
- 4 So I jumped on, and within one or two minutes, we were off
- 5 starting our cruise.
- 6 Q. Okay. Well as you walked on the boat and you walked
- 7 to your seat, how did it feel? Was it the same as walking on
- 8 land, or did you feel steady, unsteady, did you have to hold
- 9 on?
- 10 A. Actually, I can't even tell you that, sir. You know
- 11 why? Because I had two couples that were so kind to me, and
- 12 they gave me a baby pizza because they knew that I wasn't going
- 13 to take time to have my own lunch. So they bought -- they got
- 14 pizza, and they brought their pizza and had it put into a
- 15 little box for Loren, the driver of the bus, and myself. And I
- 16 can remember taking a piece of pizza out of that box, and I
- 17 wrapped it up in a napkin, and as I was getting on the boat,
- 18 somebody said, hey, how can you keep pizza in your hand without
- 19 eating it? And I said are you kidding? I'm going to devour
- 20 this thing in like a minute. And I started to bite into my
- 21 pizza. But I wrapped it up. And one of the ladies put it into
- 22 the kit basket, and she said to me, oh, Carol, you'll have this
- 23 when we finish our cruise, 'cause you know, they knew I didn't
- 24 eat a whole lot, and I was -- I had taken a couple of bites of
- 25 my pizza when I was getting over to my seat. So with that in

- 1 mind and, you know, kind of laughing over it and the whole
- 2 thing, and then re-wrapping it and somebody putting it in the
- 3 kit basket for after the cruise.
- 4 Q. Okay.
- 5 A. So that kind of silly stuff was going on when I was
- 6 getting on to the boat.
- 7 Q. Okay, that's fine. Well, as you were waiting to
- 8 leave, you would have people on the dock that would throw off
- 9 the lines. Did you notice that?
- 10 A. There wouldn't have been anybody there. There was
- 11 just the captain and the other gentleman in the white shirt.
- 12 Q. Okay. So --
- 13 A. That I remembered. Now there could have been, there
- 14 really could have been -- you know, I just, I just was in that
- 15 front area. The ladies and I got talking, and my gosh. I
- 16 guess I didn't observe that.
- 17 Q. That's fine, that's fine. So then you didn't have
- 18 any discussion with anybody that was on the dock at the time.
- 19 A. No. The only thing I asked the gentleman in the
- 20 white shirt is this boat holds 50? And he said yes, 50.
- Q. Was there any discussion about who was going to give
- 22 the tour and act as a tour quide on the boat with the people
- 23 from Shoreline Cruises?
- A. Oh, now see I'm not certain. You could probably ask
- 25 the office that because I'll tell you how this works. By the

- 1 time I get a trip, the itinerary is given to me, and then what
- 2 I do with that itinerary and the papers that I receive from the
- 3 office, they're contracts and it tells me the price that I have
- 4 to pay for things, the number of people they're expecting, the
- 5 time they're expecting it. If they send us a brochure, we have
- 6 a brochure, and all my little contract outlined is the fact
- 7 that they had 100 passengers they were expecting and the time
- 8 of it, and there was just a little Xeroxed picture of our
- 9 cruise boat at the top of the page. So when I got there, I
- 10 wouldn't have known what to expect when I got there.
- 11 Q. Okay. So no one at Shoreline Cruises asked you if
- 12 your position was to act as providing aid or care to the other
- 13 passengers while onboard. Is that correct? Like I say, I
- 14 don't want to put words in your mouth.
- 15 A. They didn't talk to me about any kind of care.
- Q. Okay. That's very -- that's all I needed to hear on
- 17 that one. Thank you very much. Just a few more. You
- 18 described a turn to the left. Now I'm not sure how much time
- 19 you've spent on boats. Obviously, the boat moves in a
- 20 direction like an automobile and can turn to the left or the
- 21 right. Is that what you're talking about in a turn, a
- 22 directional turn?
- 23 A. Well, I can't say that it was a directional turn.
- 24 Q. Uh-huh.
- 25 A. I can say this, and maybe I'm saying this after the

- 1 fact and maybe I shouldn't be, but I remember that we were at a
- 2 point of -- there was an island and there was a home there, and
- 3 I think that would've been halfway. And I can remember
- 4 thinking to myself, and I perhaps even looked at my watch
- 5 thinking we must be halfway through our cruise, he's going to
- 6 bring us back soon. Whether it was seeing that little island
- 7 and wondering are we going to kind of go around the island, is
- 8 that what we're going to do, or do we start making our turn at
- 9 this little island spot? But he was -- there were all those
- 10 beautiful mansions. But when the turn happened, I don't
- 11 believe that I was expecting a turn to take place. No.
- 12 Q. Okay. And then at some point did the boat tilt to
- 13 one direction or the other?
- 14 A. Well, yes. When it made its violent turn to the
- 15 left, it very, very much tilted right immediately.
- 16 Q. To which side?
- 17 A. To the left.
- 18 Q. The direction you were facing, it tilted to.
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. And could you just walk through the steps? Because
- 21 then you said you -- I forget how you described it. You were
- 22 shot out --
- 23 A. I dropped -- Carol Mahalak said that in her memory
- 24 bank, all she remembers is seeing me just go down to the floor
- 25 and slide across the floor like a torpedo. I do remember

- 1 falling onto the floor like on my butt and on my back, sliding,
- 2 and I slid right out of the boat.
- 3 Q. So you don't recall any shift to the opposite side?
- 4 A. To the right-hand side?
- 5 Q. Correct.
- 6 A. Oh, not at all.
- 7 Q. Okay. Thank you, that's very good. Let's see, I
- 8 have, I think you have -- oh, just a few questions. On your
- 9 way back home, did you talk to other passengers about what
- 10 happened?
- 11 A. No. I'll tell you how this was conducted on the way
- 12 home. There were Annie and Jacqueline, the two ladies that did
- 13 not take the cruise, and Emma Stevens, what was her first name,
- 14 Stevens --
- MS. BURER: Eunice?
- MS. CHARLTON: Pardon me?
- 17 MS. BURER: Eunice?
- 18 MS. CHARLTON: Eunice. Eunice Stevens, and Joe and
- 19 Carol. They were very, very verbal. And they kept talking
- 20 about it over and over again. And I knew when I listened to
- 21 them discussing it, very, very animated discussions about it at
- 22 the back, that their therapy was taking place through a lot of
- 23 talking, and words, and re-enacting it, and discussing it, and
- 24 analyzing it, and very, very vocal to each other on it. And
- 25 they were sitting at the back of the bus and they were talking.

- 1 And it was good, this was very, very good that they were doing
- 2 this and having that level of camaraderie with each other and
- 3 meeting each other on that level. The others were much more
- 4 quiet. And my position with all of that that I went and sat
- 5 with each person on a one-on-one, different times like, you
- 6 know, I just, I kind of looked behind me at different times and
- 7 I'd see where people were at, and I just sat with every one of
- 8 them on a one-on-one to just talk to them. And on the
- 9 microphone, I would say very, very little. You know, I asked
- 10 my own company the night before when we were on our way home if
- 11 I had permission to speak to them about who had perished.
- 12 And my boss, Mike Bondy, said yes, Carol, they have
- 13 the right to know who didn't make it, because this list was
- 14 given to me right after I was discharged from the hospital, and
- 15 I went to the conference because I was asked at that point if I
- 16 was up to identifying five Jane Doe's because they were ladies
- 17 that didn't -- obviously, they didn't have their badges on, and
- 18 the law enforcement agent asked me if I would be able to do
- 19 that along with my boss, and I said yes, I can, I can give
- 20 these ladies a name.
- 21 BY MR. FORD:
- 22 Q. Okay.
- 23 A. So when I did that -- now I lost my train of thought.
- I was trying to answer a question here. Oh, so I had asked --
- 25 they gave me a list of the deceased at that point, so I had

- 1 that paper with me, but I never, never said anything. And one
- 2 of them even asked me on the bus, they said, Carol, you have
- 3 knowledge of who didn't make it, don't you? And I said I'm not
- 4 exactly sure of anything right now. So many aren't sure. I
- 5 said, you know, I don't know how to answer that. I may know of
- 6 some, but I'm not sure I know of everyone. But I did know --
- 7 well, the night before, I was given permission to give those
- 8 names out.
- 9 So the following morning when we all got on the bus,
- 10 I read them out to people, and from that, I realized that
- 11 different ladies, I don't know, they just needed time, they
- 12 needed somebody. So I just, I sat with every one of them
- 13 different times throughout the two days and listened to what
- 14 they had to say. And then my vocal people at the back, I went
- 15 back there sometimes to and I would listen to what they were
- 16 saying. And they were, once again, you know, just wanting to
- 17 analyze. Very, very good, strong people. If you want some
- 18 fantastic statements, you call Joe and Carol Mahalak.
- MS. BURER: Yeah, we actually, already have spoken
- 20 with them.
- MS. CHARLTON: Yeah, they're very, very -- he has
- 22 great knowledge. They've owned seven boats, and they have a
- 23 great understanding of the water and boating.
- MS. BURER: Right.
- 25 BY MR. FORD:

- 1 Q. Okay. I just have two more questions. There was a
- 2 second bus, and they went on the de Champlain.
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. Did you talk to any of the passengers or the tour
- 5 group afterwards?
- 6 A. No. The only person that I spoke with, Carol Presley
- 7 was the group leader on that bus. Fantastic human being. I
- 8 had a chance to talk with her once we came home, and she called
- 9 the house here to see how I was doing, and she was not
- 10 impressed with her ordeal on the lake with the captain and the
- 11 cruise that they had. But she gave me little tidbits on it,
- 12 but I really, I knew she wasn't pleased with the captain on her
- 13 boat and the way that they had conducted themselves. And I
- 14 remember thinking to myself, you know, probably the captain on
- 15 his ship was doing what he thought was best, but I -- from what
- 16 Carol was telling me, she was not pleased with them.
- Q. Okay. Can I get that name then? What was that name
- 18 again of the other tour --
- 19 A. Carol Presley. P-R-E-S-L-E-Y.
- 20 Q. Okay. That's good information. Okay. I only have
- 21 one other question. Were you, to everyone's knowledge,
- 22 including Shoreline Cruises, the only person that would've been
- 23 considered a tour guide on that boat?
- A. Well, Margie Kidon, you see, she is the group leader
- 25 for Trenton. And I know with her people, she was, like she

- 1 would speak on behalf of her people when we'd go to hotels and
- 2 she would come to me and she'd say well, you know, Joyce, Joyce
- 3 and her friend, they have (indiscernible) in their room, and
- 4 they're not happy with their room. So she would come to me
- 5 with things like that. So as the group leader for Trenton, she
- 6 was verbal in her position for her people, and I had that
- 7 beautiful, beautiful Joanne Manore, who was the group leader in
- 8 Bedford. But everybody's personalities are very, very
- 9 different, and she was very laid back, and she just let me
- 10 conduct everything. She had -- there were six ladies from
- 11 Bedford on the trip, and whatever her ladies wanted to say to
- 12 me, they'd say to me directly.
- But with Margie Kidon, often times she would come to
- 14 me with issues from her people regarding they didn't like a
- 15 room, or they wanted to, you know, go somewhere different for
- 16 lunch and this type of thing. So in that respect, she might
- 17 have been seen as having some position with her people. But
- 18 she wouldn't have had any leadership in terms of how the tour
- 19 was being conducted, or you know where -- the decisions that
- 20 would be made, I would make them.
- Q. So you didn't see her talking to the people from
- 22 Shoreline Cruises, such as the two men in the outfits.
- A. No, I didn't.
- MR. FORD: Okay. Thank you very much. You've been
- 25 very helpful.

- 1 MS. CHARLTON: Thank you.
- MS. BURER: Major Rivenburgh?
- 3 BY MR. RIVENBURGH:
- 4 Q. Yes. Ms. Charlton?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. I'd like to ask just a couple questions if I may.
- 7 Your position on the boat, when you walked on the boat, your
- 8 seat was --
- 9 A. To the front, right-hand side facing the left-hand
- 10 side bench across from me.
- 11 Q. You were facing back into the boat?
- 12 A. I'm sorry?
- 13 Q. You were facing back into the vessel?
- 14 A. Well, I would've been sitting on the -- I think it
- 15 was the only seat on the right-hand side, just like there
- 16 would've only been one seat on the left-hand side at the front
- 17 of the boat that were facing into each other.
- 18 Q. Okay.
- 19 A. All the other seats would be facing the front of the
- 20 boat.
- 21 Q. Okay.
- 22 A. Looking out onto the lake.
- Q. Okay, now when you say it went over to the left, the
- 24 turn to the left, that was your left?
- 25 A. Yes. I would be looking on to the left-hand side of

- 1 the boat, and that was the side that went down.
- Q. Okay. I just want to try to get this clear in my
- 3 mind. Okay?
- 4 A. Uh-huh.
- 5 Q. The turn was to your left, which means the actual
- 6 left side of the boat where Marge Kidon was sitting was the
- 7 side that went under?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. Oh, okay. Okay. Just needed to clarify that in my
- 10 mind. It's hard when we're all so far away.
- 11 A. I know. I know that. Yes, she would've fallen
- 12 backwards. I remember her falling backwards to the water.
- Q. Okay. Now you mentioned the two captains or two crew
- 14 people anyway speaking --
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 O. -- on the dock. Did anyone from the tour, from
- 17 Shoreline Boat Tours speak to you about any type of additional
- 18 crew people or anything of that nature?
- 19 A. No, they didn't.
- Q. Okay. Was your ticket one of the comp tickets, or --
- 21 A. Well, it all ended up being such a mish-mash, I mean
- 22 you could probably say yeah.
- 23 Q. Okay.
- A. More than likely. Escorts usually do get comp
- 25 tickets. They -- it's their way of saying thank you.

- 1 Q. Okay. And you paid for the tickets.
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Okay. Did you pay by credit card voucher?
- 4 A. I paid by check.
- 5 Q. By check.
- 6 A. Uh-huh.
- 7 Q. Okay, and that was a company check, correct?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. Okay. Scanning through my notes real quick. Noted
- 10 that I didn't mark too many things to ask you about because you
- 11 did so well, such a nice job talking.
- 12 A. Thank you.
- 13 Q. Do you recall any vessels, any small boats, large
- 14 boats headed any direction on the lake prior to the incident?
- 15 A. No, I don't remember seeing any boats whatsoever.
- 16 Q. Okay. Do you recall anything about the water?
- 17 A. I'll tell you what I do remember with that water, and
- 18 I mentioned it to the investigator the night he came into the
- 19 hospital, and it was the slightest, most fleeting thought in my
- 20 mind because as I looked over, I thought to myself for a brief
- 21 second my goodness that water looks close. The water like, it
- 22 -- I don't know what I -- the water looked high. But how is
- 23 that possible? That does not make much sense, does it? I mean
- 24 I'm on a boat, the sky is beautiful, the water is glassy and
- 25 lovely. But at one-half a second, I remember thinking the

- 1 water looks high, like it's near, very near, like the boat is
- 2 low.
- 3 Q. Was that on your side or the other side?
- 4 A. I -- well, it was on my side because I remember
- 5 looking over on my side, to the right, I glanced over to the
- 6 right because most of us were looking to the left because
- 7 that's where all the beautiful mansions were.
- 8 Q. Uh-huh. Okay.
- 9 A. But I did not give it any thought. It was just a
- 10 real passing little peculiar second I --
- MR. RIVENBURGH: Okay. Ms. Charlton and Mariette, I
- 12 have no further at this point.
- MS. BURER: Okay. I have a couple more questions if
- 14 you don't mind.
- MS. CHARLTON: Go ahead.
- BY MS. BURER:
- Q. Okay. Do you remember at all in regards to any kind
- 18 of safety briefing performed by the captain?
- 19 A. No. I remember when we first got on that he said he
- 20 would be conducting a tour, and that he would be showing us
- 21 some beautiful homes along the shoreline. And, quite frankly,
- 22 we all started talking --
- 23 Q. Okay.
- 24 A. -- amongst ourselves, and we were a pretty animated
- 25 group. We talked quite a bit amongst ourselves. I say we, the

- 1 girls sitting up at the front, the ladies.
- Q. Right. I understand. What about the life jackets?
- 3 Did you notice any life jackets at all on the boat?
- 4 A. No. Nothing like that.
- 5 Q. Nothing. Okay. And do you recall anyone taking
- 6 pictures at all during the time?
- 7 A. Wow, that's an interesting question. No, I don't
- 8 think I do.
- 9 Q. Okay.
- 10 A. No. I can't say I remember seeing any cameras.
- 11 Q. Okay. Do you remember what you were wearing at the
- 12 time of the trip?
- 13 A. What I was wearing?
- 14 Q. Yes.
- 15 A. Uh-huh. I had black, black Levi jeans, like black
- 16 jeans.
- 17 Q. Okay.
- 18 A. And a white tee shirt, and a little black and brown
- 19 vest.
- 20 Q. Okay. All right.
- 21 A. And a belt, I had a black belt on. And I had brown
- 22 clogs on.
- Q. Okay. I think I'm okay for right now, but I would
- 24 like to go ahead and conclude this recorded interview, but I
- 25 would still like for you to hold -- hang on -- not hang up

```
1
    because I still have to ask you a couple personal questions,
    but I don't really want them to be recorded.
 2
 3
         Α.
              Okay.
             Okay. So I'm going to go ahead and complete this
 4
         Q.
 5
    interview.
 6
              (Whereupon, the interview in the above-entitled
 7
    matter was concluded.)
 8
 9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

## CERTIFICATE

This is to certify that the attached proceeding before the

NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD

IN THE MATTER OF: Investigation of MV Ethan Allen

Lake George, New York

October 2, 2005

Interview of Carol Charlton

DOCKET NUMBER: DCA 06 MM 001

PLACE: Washington, D.C.

DATE: October 20, 2005

was held according to the record, and that this is the original, complete, true and accurate transcript which has been compared to the recording accomplished at the hearing.

Trevy Thomas

Trevy Thomas
Transcriber